

MAKING SENSE OF VIDEO GAMES: AN ETHNOGRAPHIC CASE STUDY
ON THE MEANING-MAKING PRACTICES OF ASIAN ADOLESCENTS

by

Chia Yuan Hung

Dissertation Committee:

Professor Jo Anne Kleifgen, Sponsor
Professor Hervé Varenne

Approved by the Committee on the Degree of Doctor of Education

Date: _____

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Education in
Teachers College, Columbia University

2009

© 2009

Chia-Yuan Hung

All Rights Reserved

For my teachers

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank my family for being patient with me through this process. My parents deserve special acknowledgement, as I truly would not have been able to finish this without their support; my grandmother for having such an inspirational life; my cousin To-Ken for making me feel bad for finishing his dissertation years before me; and my brothers, Chia-Wei and Chia-Kan, for taking care of our parents and for keeping me company on Skype when I do my edits.

I want to express gratitude to the members of my dissertation committee: Professor JoAnne Kleifgen for the high expectations you have for me, your continual support of my research and your help with my final edits; Professor Hervé Varenne, for teaching me to become a reflexive scholar and for making me constantly ask myself “How would Professor Varenne see it?”; Professor Charles Kinzer, for your incredible mind; Professor Sandra Okita, for your unique insights. Many people at Teachers College have also been important, in particular, Professor Clifford Hill, who was, quite literally, there for me on Day One, Mr. Eric Larsen, for your inexhaustible knowledge about everything; Dr. Ofelia Garcia, for your energy; and Dianne Sadnytzky, for helping me navigate the system. I also want to thank Professor Michele Knobel and Professor Colin Lankshear for being so incredibly kind and generous towards my work.

My friends also deserve a special shout-out: Kati Kabát, for holding me hostage in your office and for being a first-pair part of an adjacency pair; Payal Arora, for being Payal Arora; Jennifer Fennema-Bloom, for giving me opportunities to teach; Maureen

Matarese, for making me feel less stressed out in comparison; Louise Huang, for helping me find participants; Matthew Curinga, for stalking me on the internet; Gus Andrews, for your spontaneity; Dr. “Buddy” Burniske, my high school teacher, for being an inspiration; and Chai Ping, for being in my life and teaching me so much. A shout-out to my friends at the EGGPLANT video game research lab; good luck with your research! And thank you to John, Mark, Brian, Dr. Frank, and Wayne, for all the life lessons.

Lastly, I want to thank Plato, for being my best friend.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I - INTRODUCTION	1
Background.....	3
Context of the Research.....	9
Statement of the Problem.....	12
Research Questions.....	13
CHAPTER II - REVIEW OF LITERATURE.....	15
The Study of Video Games.....	16
Video games and learning.....	22
Studies on Video Game Players.....	27
Sociological Studies of Play	30
Play as Socialization.....	30
Play as Communication	33
Studies of Social Action	39
Meaning in Social Action	40
Symbolic Interactionism and the Interpretation of Action	41
Strategic Interactions and the Framing of Experience.....	43
The Ethnomethodological Approach to Social Action.....	46
Studies in Ethnomethodology.....	49
Conversation Analysis	51
Actor-network-theory	55
Applications of Ethnomethodology and Actor-network-theory.....	57

Summary	62
CHAPTER III - METHODOLOGY	65
Participant Selection	66
Physical Setting.....	69
Virtual Setting.....	70
Data Collection Procedures	72
Participant Observation.....	72
Audiovisual Recordings of Gameplay and Conversation.....	74
Data Analysis	76
Limitations of the Study	78
Organization of the Findings	79
CHAPTER IV - SITUATED ORDERS: MAKING SENSE OF THE GAME	81
Overview.....	82
Example 1: Seeing the Order	85
Example 2: Teaching the Order	94
Example 3: Learning the order	106
Discussion.....	123
CHAPTER V - “PLAYING” THE RULES: ANALYZING PLAYER	
INTERACTIONS	126

Overview.....	127
Example 4: Environmental Hazards	131
Example 5: Cheating and its Justifications	142
Example 6: Explaining the Play.....	149
Discussion.....	154
CHAPTER VI - DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS	156
Discussion.....	156
Implications	160
Directions for Further Research.....	164
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	169
APPENDIX A: TRANSCRIPTION SYMBOLS	178
APPENDIX B: INSTRUCTIONS IN <i>SUPER SMASH BROTHERS MELEE</i>	
GAME MANUAL.....	179
APPENDIX C: FULL TRANSCRIPTION OF EXCERPTS 3.4 – 3.6	182
APPENDIX D: STAGE TRANSFORMATION IN <i>SUPER SMASH BROTHERS</i>	
<i>MELEE</i>	189
APPENDIX E: FALLING OFF THE STAGE.....	190
APPENDIX F: DESCRIPTION OF ITEMS IN <i>SUPER SMASH BROTHERS</i>	
<i>MELEE</i> GAME MANUAL.....	191

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. <i>Game Genres in Order of Popularity</i>	10
Table 2. <i>Tricky Stage Designs</i>	137

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Screenshots of Dragonraja.....	68
Figure 2. Key features of game screen	71
Figure 3. Organizing and editing data with Final Cut Pro.....	75
Figure 4. Chronology of excerpts for Examples 1 to 3.....	84
Figure 5. Damage percentage indicators in <i>Super Smash Brothers Melee</i>	86
Figure 6. Nintendo GameCube controller.....	94
Figure 7. Sample instructions for <i>Super Smash Brothers Melee</i>	95
Figure 8. Last game results screen.....	98
Figure 9. Character selection screen.....	99
Figure 10. Stage selection screen.....	99
Figure 11. Character selection screen - Picking a character	112
Figure 12. Chronological occurrence for Examples 4 to 6	130
Figure 13. Stage transformations in SSBM	132
Figure 14. Bombs and other environmental hazards	134
Figure 15. A less volatile stage design	139
Figure 16. Example of item in SSBM.....	142
Figure 17. Mutually agreed disarmament.....	144